

## **GOVERNMENT RESPONSE**

### **GOVERNMENT RESPONSE TO THE 10<sup>th</sup> REPORT OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON NATIONAL DEFENCE, ENTITLED: *CANADA AND NATO: AN ALLIANCE FORGED IN STRENGTH AND RELIABILITY***

#### **Introduction**

The Government would like to thank the members of the Committee for undertaking such a thorough study on Canada's role in the North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO). Canada's defence policy, *Strong, Secure, Engaged* (SSE), highlights NATO's importance to Canada, and reaffirms Canada's support for NATO's principle of collective defence. As well, SSE makes a number of commitments on personnel, financial and materiel contributions to NATO's efforts to adapt to the evolving global security landscape. In particular, the policy commits Canada to increase its defence spending. The Government of Canada remains committed to ensuring that Canada is a reliable and steadfast partner within the NATO Alliance.

More recently, during his visit to Latvia prior to the 2018 Brussels Summit in July 2018, the Prime Minister announced additional significant contributions to NATO. Canada will renew its contribution to NATO's enhanced Forward Presence (eFP) through Operation REASSURANCE for another four years, continue to lead NATO's eFP Battle Group Latvia as the Framework Nation, increase the number of Canadian Armed Forces (CAF) members deployed to Latvia from 455 to 540, and continue to include air surveillance, air policing, training, and maritime operations, in addition to land forces deployed to Latvia.

Canada will assume command of a new NATO training and capacity building mission in Iraq beginning in fall 2018. We will also increase our support for other NATO initiatives, including NATO's Airborne Warning and Control System (AWACS), the new NATO Command Structure and Readiness Initiative, the European Centre of Excellence for Countering Hybrid Threats, and the Cooperative Cyber Defence Centre of Excellence. Finally, Canada will continue with efforts to modernize NATO and advance its Women, Peace and Security agenda.

#### **NATO's Evolution and Response to Global Threats**

##### **Recommendation 1**

**That the Government of Canada recognize the threat posed to Canada and the values of NATO by states such as Russia, North Korea, Iran and others, and that representatives of the Government of Canada and the Canadian Armed Forces continue to raise issues related to this threat in NATO forums.**

The Government of Canada agrees with this recommendation. It understands and recognizes the threat posed to Canada and to NATO Allies, by states such as Russia, North Korea and Iran. Russia's willingness to test the international security environment raises concerns of major power competition returning to the international system. North Korea's ongoing efforts to advance its nuclear weapons and ballistic missile programs further demonstrate that North Korea poses a serious and increasing threat to both regional stability and international peace and

security. Iran already possesses a considerable number of short and medium-range ballistic missiles, which can pose a significant threat to NATO Allies. NATO is committed to ensuring that Iran's nuclear programme remains for peaceful use, in line with its international obligations and commitments to never seek, develop, or acquire a nuclear weapon.

Representatives of the Government of Canada and the CAF continue to raise and address with NATO Allies concerns regarding the threats posed by Russia, North Korea, Iran, and others (these specific concerns have been captured in the 2018 Brussels Summit declaration, endorsed by Heads of State and Government on July 11<sup>th</sup>, 2018). For example, Canada is the Chair of the NATO Military Intelligence Committee throughout 2018. As the Chair, Canada is the senior representative among Allies' Chiefs of Defence Intelligence. Canada also plays a leadership role in advancing intelligence reforms within NATO, which collectively will help the Alliance better contribute to peace and security, through improved situational awareness.

### **Recommendation 2**

**That the Government of Canada continue to support Ukraine's reform and democratization efforts that would facilitate its application for NATO membership.**

The Government of Canada agrees with this recommendation. Canada's support to Ukraine is unwavering. An independent, sovereign and stable Ukraine, firmly committed to democracy and the rule of law is key to Euro-Atlantic security. NATO Allies stand firm in their support for Ukraine's right to decide its own future and foreign policy course, free from outside interference. NATO Leaders support Ukraine's aspirations for NATO membership, as stated at the 2008 Bucharest Summit and reiterated at subsequent NATO Summits.

Canada has been at the forefront of international efforts to support Ukraine in building its own sustainable defence and security capability. Since 2014, Canada has committed over \$750 million in assistance to Ukraine. The CAF launched Operation UNIFIER to provide military training to the Ukrainian Security Forces in 2015. In March 2017, the Government of Canada announced that it has extended Operation UNIFIER until the end of March 2019. Under this mission, the CAF have deployed approximately 200 personnel and have trained over 6,350 members of the Ukrainian Security Forces. Canada has also committed to contribute \$7.25 million in non-lethal military equipment, in addition to the \$16 million already provided in the initial two-year phase of Operation UNIFIER. Canada also supports reform of the Ukrainian defence sector through the provision of a senior representative to Ukraine's Defence Reform Advisory Board. This representative provides high level expertise and recommendations to the Ukrainian President's Reform Committee. Canada is also providing a Canadian diplomat to act as deputy director of the NATO liaison office in Kyiv.

### **Recommendation 3**

**That the Government of Canada support NATO efforts to counter the threat posed by international terrorist groups.**

The Government of Canada agrees with this recommendation. NATO Leaders agreed at the 2018 Brussels Summit that terrorism poses a direct threat to the security of our populations and to international stability and prosperity more broadly. NATO Allies categorically reject terrorism as

it directly challenges the values that unite the Alliance and remain committed to continue the fight against it, through a coherent, significant, long-term effort by the international community as a whole.

Countering terrorist organizations goes beyond conventional military means and established approaches, necessitating a strategic, coordinated and whole-of-government approach to ensure terrorist organizations are degraded and ultimately defeated. Addressing this threat requires military contributions which are coordinated with political, developmental, economic, law enforcement, and intelligence agencies both within Canada and with our international Allies and partners.

While nations retain the primary responsibility for their domestic security and their own resilience, NATO can play a valuable role in helping to counter terrorist threats. For example, at the 2018 Brussels Summit, NATO launched a non-combat training and capacity building mission in Iraq, headed by Major-General Dany Fortin, to support the Iraqi government in its efforts to stabilize the country and fight terrorism. As announced at the 2018 Brussels Summit by the Prime Minister, Canada will lead the NATO mission in Iraq for one year. Approximately 250 Canadian troops will be stationed in Iraq to help Iraq build a more effective national security structure and improve training for Iraqi security services. Canada has also committed to deploy a Gender Advisor as part of the mission.

#### **Recommendation 4**

**That the Government of Canada closely monitor efforts by the Permanent Structured Cooperation (PESCO) initiative of the European Union and to guard against duplication of efforts to ensure that PESCO does not compete for limited military resources nor undermine NATO operations.**

The Government of Canada agrees with this recommendation. The Department of National Defence and the Canadian Armed Forces (DND/CAF) and Global Affairs Canada (GAC) closely follow developments related to the Permanent Structured Cooperation (PESCO), including future modalities on third states participation. Canada is providing a diplomat to NATO to work on NATO-European Union (EU) issues to help ensure coordination between the two organizations on their efforts to enhance cooperation.

PESCO was formally established in December 2017 as part of the EU's Global Strategy on Foreign and Security Policy implementation. The aim of PESCO is to develop joint defence capabilities and make them available for EU military operations. Military capabilities developed within PESCO remain sovereign assets of EU member states, which they can make available to organizations, such as NATO and the United Nations (UN). An update on PESCO including a decision on modalities for participation of third States (such as Canada) is expected by November 2018.

The EU's Global Strategy on Foreign and Security Policy calls for close cooperation between the EU and NATO: "The EU will [...] deepen cooperation with the North Atlantic Alliance in complementarity, synergy, and full respect for the institutional framework, inclusiveness and decision-making autonomy of the two. In this context, the EU needs to be strengthened as a

security community: European security and defence efforts should enable the EU to act autonomously while also contributing to and undertaking actions in cooperation with NATO.”

As a NATO Ally, Canada welcomes the EU’s work on security and defence in a way that is transparent and is complementary to the Alliance. Under the Canada-EU Strategic Partnership Agreement, Canada and the EU have committed to continue their efforts to further strengthen transatlantic security and to enhance our joint efforts in support of international peace and security, including participating in the EU’s Common Security and Defence Policy missions.

## **Canada and NATO Operations**

### **Recommendation 5**

**That the Government of Canada continue to play a leadership role in NATO’s enhanced Forward Presence in Latvia as part of Canada and NATO’s ongoing commitment to democracy and stability in Europe, in view of Russia’s invasion and continued occupation of eastern Ukraine and its illegal annexation of Crimea.**

The Government of Canada agrees with this recommendation. Canada continues to fully support Ukraine’s independence, territorial integrity and sovereignty. The Government of Canada has consistently and publicly condemned Russia’s aggressive actions, including the illegal and illegitimate annexation of Crimea and its continuing destabilization efforts in Eastern Ukraine. Independent of NATO, Canada has taken a lead role through Operation UNIFIER to support the Ukrainian government and in particular the Ukrainian Security Forces, by providing training in a variety of areas designed to enhance their overall professionalism and capabilities.

Canada continues to play a leadership role in NATO’s enhanced Forward Presence (eFP) in Latvia. During his visit to Latvia prior to the 2018 Brussels Summit in July 2018, the Prime Minister announced the extension of Canada’s contribution to NATO’s eFP in Latvia for another four years, from April 1<sup>st</sup>, 2019, to March 31<sup>st</sup>, 2023. Canada will continue to lead the multinational Battle Group based in Latvia, and will increase the number of CAF personnel taking part in the land element of this operation from 455 to 540. As part of Canada’s contribution to NATO’s wider Operation REASSURANCE, the Royal Canadian Navy (RCN) will also continue to deploy naval assets on a persistent rotational basis for exercises and operational tasks primarily with NATO’s Maritime Forces. Canada’s contribution to NATO will also continue to include an Air Task Force comprised of up to six aircraft to conduct periodic air surveillance, air policing and bilateral or multilateral training activities in Europe. Canada has also provided a Gender Advisor for the Battle Group and will continue to do so for the next three years. Through these and other activities, Canada continues to demonstrate its commitment to promoting and protecting global stability, the primacy of the rules-based international order, and the principle of collective defence, all of which underpin Canadian security and prosperity.

## **Recommendation 6**

### **That the Government of Canada continue to invest in research and training development, deployment of personnel in operational headquarters (HQ) and NATO HQ positions.**

The Government of Canada agrees with this recommendation. DND/CAF have worked hard over the years to maintain professional and knowledgeable representation within NATO. Canada has had a long history of supporting NATO endeavours in numerous ways, including the recent announcement that Canada will provide 25 AWACS positions in support of NATO-led operations. Since 2013, Canada's military personnel contributions have primarily centred around four NATO Headquarters locations:

- Supreme Headquarters Allied Powers Europe (SHAPE) – the strategic level HQ of NATO's Allied Command Operations (Mons, Belgium);
- Allied Joint Force Command (JFC) Brunssum (Brunssum, Netherlands);
- Allied Joint Force Command (JFC) Naples (Naples, Italy); and
- NATO International Military Staff (IMS) (Brussels, Belgium).

From 2013 to present, Canada has increased its contribution to NATO HQ from 64 to 103 personnel. Furthermore, Canada also maintains a footprint at the Allied Command Transformation (ACT) in Norfolk, Virginia. As a result, Canada's overall contribution to NATO is currently in excess of 250 personnel. Also, the NATO Defense College in Rome is currently headed by a Canadian commandant, Lieutenant-General Christine Whitecross.

The CAF ensures that all staff officers deploying as part of NATO staff are properly trained for their positions. Canada's higher level education/training programs, such as the National Security Program (NSP) and the Joint Command and Staff Program (JCSP), share many similarities with other NATO nations. Because of this, NATO nations are able to send individuals to other nations' command and staff programs, which enhances interoperability. Canada has allocated permanent seats to the United States, United Kingdom, France, Germany, and Belgium on one or both programs, and has offered seats to Norway, Poland, Latvia, the Netherlands, Croatia, Albania, and Turkey in the past.

Canada is also an active participant in the NATO Training Group (NTG), responsible for both collective and individual training and education. Canada is represented by the CAF on both the Steering Group and the Executive Working Group of the NTG. Additionally, each of the services provides active membership on the Executive Working Group's service task groups.

One of the most long-standing NATO task groups is the Task Group on Individual Training and Education Development (the Canadian Defence Academy (CDA) is directly involved). This task group supports the development and implementation of education, training, exercise and evaluation policies, directives and standards, recommends solutions to education and training requirements, and facilitates sharing of best practices among nations and the NATO Command Structure.

Canada is one of the top five contributors to NATO science and technology among all NATO nations. For more information, please refer to the response to Recommendation 17.

## **Canada Matters to NATO**

### **Recommendation 7**

**That Canada participate in the NATO Defence Planning Process (NDPP) and complete an annual capability report clearly defining and measuring capability by defence objective, including personnel numbers, readiness training levels, equipment technology levels and interoperability.**

Canada fully adheres to and participates in the NATO Defence Planning Process (NDPP). As part of this effort, Canada produces a number of reports for NATO on the CAF's capabilities. While the Government of Canada supports the principle of this recommendation, producing an additional annual capability report would duplicate existing efforts.

The NDPP provides a framework within which national and NATO defence planning activities can be harmonized to meet capability requirements in the most effective way. The NDPP consists of five steps conducted over a period of four years. Canada recognizes the value and importance of the NDPP and participates actively in every step of the process: the development of political guidance that sets out the overall aims and objectives to be achieved by the Alliance, the identification of Minimum Capability Requirements to achieve objectives, the assignment of NATO Capability Targets to Allies, the vetting and implementation of assigned targets, and monitoring implementation with the biennial Defence Planning Capability Survey (DPCS). The DPCS is a classified NATO Capability Report outlining the degree to which the Allied forces and capabilities can collectively meet NATO's level of ambition.

Canada fully participates in the NATO Capability Review process as part of its Alliance commitment and produces a comprehensive classified report. This document also includes information on the readiness levels of the CAF, as well as updates on any new equipment/capabilities and interoperability.

### **Recommendation 8**

**That the Government of Canada re-vitalize and re-establish Canada as a leader in military training within the alliance, including NATO Flying Training, military engineering, communications engineering capabilities, and Women, Peace and Security capabilities.**

The Government of Canada agrees with this recommendation. Canada is an active participant within the NATO Training Group (NTG), whose mandate is to enhance professionalism, interoperability and standardization among Alliance and partner forces. This is enabled by improved co-ordination of education, training, exercise, and evaluation, with particular emphasis on supporting operations. As a member of this group, Canada sends delegates to Executive Working Group and Steering Committee meetings. These two bodies provide a permanent network for consultation whereby Canada can influence the direction of NATO strategic training guidance and impart lessons learned from its training experience. Notably, Canada has recently taken on a leadership role in a number of substantial NATO exercises and in shaping exercise design.

Canada has played a significant role in the training of Allied aircrew since World War II. This continues today with the NATO Flying Training in Canada (NFTC) Program at Royal Canadian Air Force (RCAF) bases in Moose Jaw, Saskatchewan, and Cold Lake, Alberta. For many years, Canada has provided basic and advanced jet training and fighter lead-in training to NATO partners and other allies. To date, Austria, Denmark, France, Germany, Hungary, Italy, Norway, and the United Kingdom have provided students and/or instructors to the NFTC program.

Canada also offers both individual and collective engineer training to NATO. Individual training is currently provided through the Canadian Forces School of Military Engineering (CFSME). Collective training currently takes place through a number of exercises including: Exercise ROGUSH BUOY, an engineer dive exercise, and Exercise ARDENT DEFENDER, a joint counter explosive threat exercise. Additionally, engineers continue to provide training to NATO partners, including as part of Operation REASSURANCE.

There is also an option to provide additional engineering training through CFSME in conjunction with existing combat engineering and construction engineering courses. Attendance by NATO Allies on joint exercises such as Operation NANOOK in Canada's north and engineer exercises offer additional collective training opportunities.

The Government of Canada also continues to be a leading contributor to NATO Women, Peace and Security (WPS) objectives, consistently promoting the integration of a gender perspective across the Alliance, and is the largest contributor to the NATO WPS office (see recommendation 23). For example, Canada supports the NATO International Military Staff's Office of the Gender Advisor (IMS GENAD) and provides Deputy Chairs to the NATO Committee on Gender Perspectives. A Canadian military officer has recently been selected and will be assigned as the next IMS GENAD for a three year period. As well, in 2017 Canada assigned a Canadian military officer to the Nordic Center for Gender in Military Operations (NCGM) for a three-year period.

## **NATO Burden-Sharing and Defence Spending**

### **Recommendation 9**

**That the Government of Canada take steps to meet the 2014 Wales Summit target, and advocate to NATO the establishment of a contributions measurement system that goes beyond the 2.0% expenditure on Gross Domestic Product (GDP) metric. Further, that the Government of Canada consider taking into account other quantitative and qualitative considerations to contributions from NATO member states.**

The Government of Canada agrees with this recommendation. Canada is taking steps to move towards the 2% guideline set in the Defence Investment Pledge as agreed at the 2014 Wales Summit and confirmed at the 2018 Brussels Summit.

Canada is currently the sixth largest contributor to NATO common funding and is among the top six in terms of defence spending per capita. SSE commits to increase Canada's defence budget by over 70% between 2016-17 and 2026-27. This increase is expected to translate into Canada spending approximately 1.4% of its GDP on defence-related expenditures in 2024. For reference, Canada spent 1.15% of its GDP on defence-related expenditures in 2016-2017. Canada's defence

spending on major equipment is also rising and is expected to reach 32% of defence spending in 2024, well above the NATO guideline of 20%.

Canada, along with other NATO Allies, actively supports a concept of burden-sharing that is broader than simply defence spending. At the 2018 Brussels Summit, Allies agreed to submit credible national plans on the implementation of the Defence Investment Pledge as well as on planned capabilities and contributions to NATO and non-NATO operations and missions. The Alliance recognizes that other quantitative and qualitative considerations, such as the quantity and quality of capabilities developed by Allies and Allies' ability and willingness to contribute to operations and missions, are essential elements of burden-sharing.

Canada continually demonstrates its willingness to provide high-quality contributions to operations and missions reinforcing the security and defence of the Euro-Atlantic, including through its deployment as a framework nation in NATO's eFP in Latvia, its leadership role in the newly-established NATO mission in Iraq, Operation UNIFIER in Ukraine, and its support to the Afghan security and defence forces, among other contributions.

### **Public Outreach, Educational Awareness and Communications Issues**

#### **Recommendation 10**

**That the Government of Canada engage with colleges, universities, think-tanks, researchers, and industry, to develop an educational platform in addition to supporting the #WeAreNATO campaign and the NATO Association of Canada, to inform Canadians on the history and importance of NATO to Canada's defence policy, in guaranteeing peace and security in the world, and to strengthen our understanding and commitment to this important organization.**

The Government of Canada agrees with this recommendation. The Government of Canada continues to support raising awareness on the importance of NATO, including through the #WeAreNATO campaign. Launched on Government of Canada social media platforms in April 2018 and supported by the Canadian Joint Delegation to NATO's social media activity, this largely digital campaign is aimed at promoting Canada's role in NATO. Its objective is to explain the value of NATO membership to Canadians and why NATO matters.

Before the 2018 Brussels Summit, the Prime Minister, Minister of National Defence and Minister of Foreign Affairs had a noteworthy engagement with the Atlantic Council on Foreign Relations, which generated significant Canadian media coverage. In addition, Canada's Ambassador to NATO regularly organizes and engages in outreach to Canadian universities, researchers and industry.

Other efforts are also underway to bolster Canadians' knowledge and understanding of NATO. The Department's Defence Engagement Program (DEP) promotes a multidisciplinary approach to security and defence issues by offering support to partners in academia, non-governmental organizations, think-tanks and the private sector. Each year the DEP aligns its priorities with the key defence and security issues of importance to DND/CAF. NATO features as a prominent and



recurring priority on this list, with Canadian and international academics and organizations encouraged to explore such topics as:

- How can Canada participate in NATO's strengthened defence and deterrence posture and how does it align with Canadian interests?
- How should NATO balance its defence and deterrence activities with the need to project stability and combat terrorism?
- How can NATO address emerging challenges in the sphere of strategic communications and how can Canada better coordinate with the Alliance on this issue?
- How can Canada prioritise its capabilities to best serve Canadian and NATO interests?
- What are the main challenges threatening NATO's future?

The DEP provides targeted engagement grants for individuals and institutions to undertake academic activities, conferences, publications or other initiatives that are directly relevant to Canada's defence engagement priorities. In the last two years alone, ten such grants have been allocated in support of academic conferences and activities promoting the importance of NATO to Canada's defence policy (e.g. a workshop examining the Ukraine crisis in relation to NATO and Russia, and a research project aimed at developing an effective strategic communication policy for increasing awareness of the CAF and NATO among university students). The NATO Association of Canada was also the recipient of a targeted engagement grant for a conference it hosted on Canada and NATO. The DEP also hosts a number of Expert Briefing Series events whereby partners in academia, non-governmental organizations, think-tanks and the private sector are invited to present to a Government of Canada audience on any number of defence issues, including NATO.

SSE committed to invest a further \$4.5 million a year – a nearly 900% increase – into this successful program. It calls for a revamped and expanded program, including an enhanced relationship with the external expert community through expansion of the existing Expert Briefing Series and targeted engagement grants, as well as the establishment of collaborative networks of experts, and a new scholarship program. The DEP has already taken steps towards this end. For example, the program has already launched a trial to help inform the collaborative network concept with the Balsillie School of International Affairs, in collaboration with the Centre for the Study of Security and Development at Dalhousie University. Among the many areas the network will be exploring are key issues relating to NATO Allies, such as collective deterrence, Russia's relationship toward NATO, and Arctic security. The Defence Policy's direction regarding engaging experts represents an opportunity to transform how the Government of Canada, through DND/CAF, collaborates with this community and supports a stronger defence and security dialogue with Canadians on a host of topics, including NATO.

### **Recommendation 11**

**That the Government of Canada and the House of Commons continue to support, invest in and recognize the value of the role of Parliamentarians, including the NATO Parliamentary Assembly, in Canada's NATO relationship.**

The Government of Canada agrees with this recommendation. The Government of Canada regularly supports Parliamentarians from both Houses in their efforts to raise awareness of

Canada's NATO engagement. Since the beginning of this current Parliament, the Government of Canada has assisted the House Standing Committee on National Defence (NDDN), the Canadian NATO Parliamentary Association (comprised of both Members of Parliament and Senators), and the NATO Parliamentary Assembly in studying issues related to NATO, Canada's role in NATO, and global threats. These efforts play an important role in educating Canadians on what NATO is and how Canada's broad and historical engagement with NATO, its members and its partners contributes to the defence of Canada and to international peace and security. Through the Government of Canada's support, including by facilitating visits and briefings, Parliamentarians across the Alliance have seen firsthand how Canada takes a leadership role in NATO, contributes to NATO operations, and actively participates in shaping the policies and priorities for Canada's Arctic region (i.e. NATO Parliamentary Assembly trip to Canada's Arctic in fall 2017). The Government of Canada will continue to fully support the efforts of Parliamentarians.

### **Recommendation 12**

#### **That the Government of Canada publish an annual report on global threats and national defence.**

The Government of Canada agrees with this recommendation and will continue to publish a variety of reports annually on global threats. For example, the Government of Canada regularly reports on global threats and their impact on national defence, and this information is critical to how Canada's defence and security community protects Canada and Canadian interests. SSE is informed by a rigorous analysis of the security environment, including key trends and threats and their implications for Canada and DND/CAF. This analysis (available in the "Global Context" section of SSE) provided the evidence-based foundation upon which Canada's new vision and approach to defence were developed, as well as the wide range of concrete new initiatives and investments that will ensure that DND/CAF can meet Canada's defence needs, now and in the future. DND reports annually on its priorities and its progress in delivering its programming through the Departmental Plan and Departmental Results Report. Both of these documents include assessments of the operating context and the key risks to delivering on the defence mandate, which include considerations of the key threat trends driving National Defence planning.

The Government of Canada also regularly reports on various global threats to Canada. For example, Public Safety Canada publishes an annual public report on the terrorist threat to Canada (<https://www.publicsafety.gc.ca/cnt/rsrscs/pblctns/pblc-rprt-trrst-thrt-cnd-2017/index-en.aspx>). For Canadians travelling abroad, GAC publishes up-to-date information on the potential threats and risks to travellers, as well as advisories for individual countries and regions of the world (<https://travel.gc.ca/travelling/advisories>).

## NATO's Procurement and Defence Industry Issues

### Recommendation 13

**That the Government of Canada invest in accountability structures, management frameworks and performance based contracts with strong incentives and disincentives to ensure timely, efficient and effective military procurement, perhaps reviewing the overall government defence procurement structure and considering the establishment of a Department of Defence Procurement to meet NATO capability and burden sharing.**

The Government of Canada partially agrees with this recommendation. While the Government agrees with the recommendation to streamline military procurement, establishing a Department of Defence Procurement would impact whole-of-government collaboration that preserves existing departmental mandates. DND/CAF, in collaboration with partners across the federal government and the Canadian defence industry, has taken a number of steps to improve and streamline defence procurement and ensure timely military procurement, which helps Canada more effectively meet its NATO capability planning and burden-sharing obligations. As outlined in SSE, DND is working with its partners to increase DND/CAF's contracting authorities for goods and services up to \$5 million. This increased contracting authority will allow more than 80% of defence contracts to be managed directly by DND, thereby streamlining the approvals process for these procurements.

To modernize Canada's approach to sustainment program development and procurement, DND, in collaboration with Public Services and Procurement Canada, and Innovation, Science and Economic Development Canada, have undertaken the Sustainment Initiative to transform the business of sustainment – in-service support – for military equipment and fleets. The initiative focuses on the analysis of all major in-service support contracts and ensures that contract awards result in solutions that maximize the value for Canada by optimizing equipment performance, value for money, flexibility, and economic benefits.

With regard to the recommendation that the Government consider the establishment of a Department of Defence Procurement, Canada's approach to defence procurement is based upon whole-of-government collaboration that preserves existing departmental mandates and is supported by robust interdepartmental governance at all levels up to Ministers. A guiding principle of this linked governance environment is that decisions are taken at the lowest level possible with a clear process to escalate them quickly if necessary to resolve differences. This comprehensive approach ensures that appropriate expertise is engaged throughout the acquisitions process and that decisions are made in a transparent manner.

#### **Recommendation 14**

**That the Government of Canada play a more active and engaged role in facilitating Canadian-owned defence companies to compete on and secure NATO procurement contracts. That the Government of Canada also continue to invest in, and support Canada's delegation to the NATO Industrial Advisory Group (NIAG) to ensure that Canada's defence industry understands the value and importance of NATO procurement.**

The Government of Canada agrees with this recommendation. The Government of Canada continues to play an active role in facilitating and supporting Canadian-owned defence companies when competing for NATO procurement contracts. DND/CAF and Global Affairs Canada, including the Canadian Embassy to Belgium and the Joint Canadian Delegation to NATO developed a strategic plan to inform and enable Canadian industries to fairly compete for and secure NATO procurement contracts. Under the strategic plan a number of initiatives aimed at promoting awareness of NATO business opportunities are being pursued, such as promoting NATO opportunities at national and international defence industry trade shows, conducting web seminars to inform and educate industry, and organizing Canadian trade missions to NATO procurement agencies. Additionally, the strategic plan seeks to increase the Canadian defence industry's early awareness of future NATO capability package requirements. DND/CAF will continue to support Canada's delegation to the NATO Industrial Advisory Group to help address Canadian interests at NATO.

#### **Recommendation 15**

**That the Government of Canada increase the number of National Technical Expert (NATEX) positions, with at least one full-time NATEX in the NATO Communications and Information Agency (NCIA) in Brussels, to assist Canadian industry bids on leading edge NATO contracts and to also ensure that no portion of the process of awarding NATO procurement contracts imposes unfair disadvantages on Canadian business.**

The Government of Canada agrees with the principle of this recommendation and will continue to staff positions to assist with Canadian industry bids on NATO contracts. DND/CAF currently has a locally engaged staff serving as a National Technical Expert (NATEX) within the NATO Communications and Information Agency (NCIA) and is working towards re-establishing the part-time position with a military member. Additionally, DND/CAF has established for the first time a Canadian Liaison Officer to the NATO Support and Procurement Agency (NSPA) in Luxembourg. The NSPA Liaison Officer and the NATEX are responsible for maintaining a comprehensive awareness of the ongoing and future procurement initiatives at NCIA and NSPA, along with the agencies internal processes. By maintaining this awareness, the NATEX and NSPA Liaison Officers are able to increase the visibility of these opportunities to Canadian industry, and assist companies with the administrative aspects of the bidding process. Coordinated efforts between the NSPA Liaison Officer, the NATEX, the Trade Commissioner Service and staff at Canadian Joint Delegation to NATO serve to review Canadian industry activities and develop strategies to identify, coordinate, and communicate NATO business opportunities.

### **Recommendation 16**

**That the Government of Canada endeavour to provide programming for pilot project launches with the Canadian Armed Forces (CAF) where Canadian leading edge technology can fill national defence and security requirements, such as the former Canadian Innovation Commercialization Program (CICP).**

The Government of Canada agrees with this recommendation. Currently, there are several Government of Canada innovation programs where Canadian leading edge technology can fulfill national defence and security requirements. Through calls for proposals, such programs solicit proposals from industry, academia and not-for-profit organizations to address defence and security challenges and develop concepts and technologies to enhance Canadian capability. A few examples of these programs include:

- The Innovation for Defence Excellence and Security (IDEaS) program announced in SSE commits to \$1.6 billion of investment in innovations for defence and security over the next 20 years. IDEaS fosters open innovation to provide creative thinkers with the structure and support to encourage solutions, which will assist in solving some of Canada's toughest defence and security challenges. IDEaS will stimulate innovation through a range of activities including competitions, networks, and sandboxes to field test concepts. The first call for proposals addressed challenges in domains such as surveillance, cyber tools for defence, space, artificial intelligence, remotely pilot systems, data analytics, and human performance (<https://www.canada.ca/en/department-national-defence/programs/defence-ideas.html>).
- The Canadian Safety and Security Program (CSSP) program, which focuses on strengthening Canada's ability to anticipate, prevent, mitigate, prepare for, respond to and recover from natural disasters, serious accidents, crime and terrorism through the convergence of science and technology (S&T) with the policy, operations and intelligence domains ([http://www.science.gc.ca/eic/site/063.nsf/eng/h\\_5B5BE154.html](http://www.science.gc.ca/eic/site/063.nsf/eng/h_5B5BE154.html)).

### **NATO Research and Development and Emerging Technologies**

#### **Recommendation 17**

**That the Government of Canada ensure adequate funds are allotted for research and development in order to adapt to the rapid pace of technological change and the increased prevalence of hybrid warfare.**

The Government of Canada agrees with this recommendation. Canada is one of the top five contributors to NATO research and development among all NATO nations, leading in terms of strategic influence and scientific excellence. Involved in some 200 NATO S&T activities, the Government of Canada is participating in 70% of all activities under the NATO S&T programme of work. Canada's estimated financial and in-kind contribution is approximately \$10M per year. Joint work is carried out within the NATO S&T Organization's research clusters around the following topics: applied vehicle technology, human factors and medicine, information system technologies, modelling and simulation, system analysis and design, sensors and electronic technology, and system concept and integration.

In addition, through various NATO activities, the Government of Canada contributes to and supports countering hybrid warfare through cooperation within NATO on hybrid operations, hybrid tactical network, communications and electromagnetic warfare and electronic warfare in urban environments. Given the disruptive potential of developments in hybrid warfare, Canadian S&T addresses the topic within NATO, as well as developing its capability through Five Eyes and internal defence S&T program, which can be leveraged to benefit the Alliance.

## **NATO and Cyber Defence**

### **Recommendation 18**

**That the Government of Canada invest further to address our NATO commitment to enhance the electromagnetic pulse and cyber defences of command and control, national infrastructures and networks, and our commitment to the indivisibility of Allied security and collective defence, in accordance with the Enhanced NATO Policy on Cyber Defence adopted in Wales.**

The Government of Canada agrees with this recommendation. The Government of Canada recognizes the importance of our NATO commitment and contributions in the cyber domain. Canada works with NATO Allies to identify areas for investment, including electromagnetic pulse and cyber defences of command and control, and to enhance national infrastructure and networks. Canada will continue to look for opportunities in the cyber domain within the NATO framework. Canada is committed to the Enhanced NATO Policy on Cyber Defence adopted at the 2014 Wales Summit and the Cyber Defence Pledge adopted at the 2016 Warsaw Summit.

At the 2018 Brussels Summit, NATO Leaders agreed that NATO will continue to adapt to the evolving cyber threat landscape and implement cyberspace as a domain of operations. As well, Allies agreed to support work to maintain international peace and security in cyberspace and to promote stability and reduce the risk of conflict, recognizing that we all stand to benefit from a norms-based, predictable, and secure cyberspace.

## **NATO and the Arctic**

### **Recommendation 19**

**That the Government of Canada take a leading role within NATO to specialize in Arctic defence and security doctrine and capabilities, and enhance NATO's situational awareness in the Arctic, including joint training and military exercises for NATO members in the Canadian Arctic.**

The Government of Canada agrees with this recommendation. In the rapidly changing security environment, the Government of Canada recognizes the importance of working cooperatively with like-minded Allies and partners to advance our shared interests in Arctic security.

SSE underscores the Government of Canada's commitment to Arctic security and recognizes the importance of building and maintaining strong partnerships to preserve stability and peace in the region. To this end, the Government of Canada continues to support the strengthening of

situational awareness and information sharing in the north, including with NATO. Canada continues to work with Allies and partners as we conduct joint research, as well as train and exercise together to improve our collective ability to operate in cold weather environments. The Government of Canada is investing in a range of maritime, land, air, and space capabilities that will position the CAF as a leader in the region. Canada also contributes to strengthening awareness in the Arctic by working with the United States to modernize the North American Aerospace Defence Command (NORAD).

Through Operation NANOOK, Canada's largest military activity in the North, the CAF continues to work with domestic partners and international military Allies and partners in joint training to respond to threats to the defence, security, and safety of Canadians. The 2018 iteration of Operation NANOOK includes participation or observation from a number of NATO Allies, including the United States, the United Kingdom, Denmark and Germany.

Furthermore, to foster positive engagement in the Arctic region, DND/CAF hosted a delegation from the NATO Parliamentary Assembly in Canada's Arctic in fall 2017. One of the main goals of this visit was to help Parliamentarians from various NATO member states learn more about challenges in the Arctic. The CAF also continues to collaborate with Arctic Allies and partners through multilateral fora such as the Arctic Security Forces Roundtable, which Canada hosted for the first time in May 2018.

Going forward, the Government of Canada will continue to look for opportunities to cooperate with Allies and partners in Arctic training and exercises, as well as in other areas of mutual interest, which will help Canada achieve its vision of being strong at home, secure in North America, and engaged in the world.

## **NATO and Maritime Security**

### **Recommendation 20**

**That the Government of Canada respond to calls for NATO members to increase the quantity and quality of their naval fleets and underwater surveillance capabilities in light of ongoing challenges to NATO members at sea by beginning the process of replacing Canada's Victoria Class submarine fleet with new submarines that have under-ice capabilities and that the CAF increase the size of the fleet in order to enhance our Arctic and North Atlantic defence preparedness.**

The Government of Canada does not agree with this recommendation. The Government is in the midst of its most intensive and comprehensive fleet modernization and renewal in the peacetime history of the RCN. In SSE, the Government of Canada reaffirmed its commitment to the National Shipbuilding Strategy (NSS) – a planned investment of tens of billions to renew the federal fleets. As part of this commitment, Canada is recapitalizing and increasing the size of the surface fleet through investments in 15 Canadian Surface Combatants (CSC), two Joint Support Ships (JSS), and five to six Arctic and Offshore Patrol Ships (AOPS). The Government has also committed to modernizing the four Victoria-class submarines to include weapons and sensor upgrades that will enhance the ability of the submarines to conduct Intelligence, Surveillance and Reconnaissance (ISR) and deliver necessary improvements of platform and combat systems to

extend operational capability to the mid-2030's. Upgrades to enhance naval intelligence, armament, and surveillance and reconnaissance systems for current and future surface platforms will continue to meet future challenges. This will include upgrades to underwater warfare suites and light weight torpedoes as well as the addition of an unmanned aircraft system capability to the Halifax-class fleet. Augmenting the RCN's capabilities at sea is the introduction of the Cyclone Maritime Helicopter, which will be capable of embarking in all classes of surface ships in the RCN fleet and conducting anti-submarine and anti-surface warfare, search and rescue and utility missions in support of RCN operations at sea.

Canada is fully engaged in the re-building of the Anti-Submarine Warfare (ASW) capabilities of today's fleet through the introduction of technologies, sensors and weapons while preparing to transition to the fleet of the future. As part of the NATO S&T Organization, Canada is participating in the Maritime Unmanned Systems S&T Pre-Feasibility Studies that focus on ASW and naval mine warfare capabilities with Allied nations that have the same capability targets. In addition to increasing existing platform capabilities, the RCN is also in the process of re-vitalising individual and collective ASW training and advancing distributed mission training and synthetic training environments. The exploitation of simulation and federated training facilities with Alliance partners will be critical to validate overarching ASW concepts and more specifically relationships, methodologies and procedures to be exercised in initiatives such as standing Theatre ASW Command.

This strategy will deliver the right mix of platforms and systems for the Navy to meet Canada's future defence and security challenges at home and abroad and enhance Arctic and North American defence preparedness.

While not a naval asset, the RCAF's CP-140 Aurora fleet is renowned for its maritime patrol and ASW capabilities. With its latest upgrades, the CP-140 is able to detect and destroy the latest generation of stealth submarines.

## **Nuclear Proliferation and Nuclear Disarmament**

### **Recommendation 21**

**That the Government of Canada take a leadership role within NATO in beginning the work necessary for achieving the NATO goal of creating the conditions for a world free of nuclear weapons. That this initiative be undertaken on an urgent basis in view of the increasing threat of nuclear conflict flowing from the renewed risk of nuclear proliferation, the deployment of so-called tactical nuclear weapons, and changes in nuclear doctrines regarding lowering the threshold for first use of nuclear weapons by Russia and the US.**

The Government of Canada agrees with this recommendation. Advancing nuclear disarmament in a concrete and meaningful way remains a priority for the Government of Canada. Canada absolutely recognizes the grave consequences of a nuclear detonation, which are clear and beyond dispute. Canada remains fully committed to pursuing pragmatic initiatives to help realize a world free of nuclear weapons.



Recognizing the current challenging global security environment, Allies recognize that arms control, disarmament, and non-proliferation have made and should continue to make an essential contribution to achieving the Alliance's security objectives and for ensuring strategic and collective security. NATO has a long track record of doing its part on disarmament and non-proliferation. After the end of the Cold War, NATO dramatically reduced the number of nuclear weapons stationed in Europe and its reliance on nuclear weapons in NATO strategy. While NATO will remain a nuclear alliance as long as nuclear weapons exist, Canada continues to support the maintenance of nuclear weapons at the lowest levels of alert, noting that the circumstances in which NATO might have to use nuclear weapons are extremely limited.

Fifty years since the Treaty on Non-Proliferation of Nuclear Weapons (NPT) opened for signature, it remains the cornerstone of the global non-proliferation regime and has an essential role in the maintenance of international peace, security and stability. Allies are strongly committed to full implementation of the NPT in all its aspects, including nuclear disarmament, non-proliferation, and the peaceful use of nuclear energy. NATO's nuclear arrangements have always been fully consistent with the NPT.

Canada also believes that NATO's deterrence and defence posture must be balanced with support for confidence-building measures that can help advance, step-by-step, the nuclear disarmament agenda. Canada's current priority is to advance progress toward the negotiation of a Fissile Material Cut-off Treaty (FMCT). Canada is pleased with the consensus report achieved by the Canadian-chaired UN Expert Group that lays out in plain language a menu of potential provisions regarding a future treaty's scope, definitions, verification, and legal and institutional arrangements. NATO members recognize that negotiations on a FMCT should begin without further delay within the Conference on Disarmament.

In addition, Canada, along with many NATO Allies, is helping to build global nuclear disarmament verification capabilities through support to the International Partnership for Nuclear Disarmament Verification (IPNDV).

This work exemplifies Canada's commitment to practical and inclusive measures to unite nuclear and non-nuclear armed states in working towards advancing nuclear disarmament.

## **NATO and the Space Domain**

### **Recommendation 22**

**That the Government of Canada support NATO efforts to draft a space strategy to include treaties and codes of conduct governing military attacks on space assets and to reduce debris and congestion in space orbits.**

The Government of Canada agrees with this recommendation. The Government of Canada intends to play an active role in the development of an overarching NATO Space Policy, as agreed by Heads of State and Government at the 2018 Brussels NATO Summit. This approach is in line with principles set in SSE which promotes international norms of responsible behaviour in space required to ensure the peaceful use of outer space.

## **Women, Peace and Security**

### **Recommendation 23**

**That the Government of Canada support increased participation of women in NATO by becoming a leader in gender-based operational training; by reporting annually on Canada's progress on Women, Peace and Security within its military; by working with NATO to further develop gender-based policies and procedures; and by hosting an international integrated military and civilian conference on Women, Peace and Security.**

The Government of Canada agrees with this recommendation in principle and is actively engaged in the promotion and advancement of the WPS agenda at NATO. However, although Canada is widely recognised as a leader in this area, there are no current plans to have an international conference as recommended. Canada promotes the integration of a gender perspective across the Alliance and in decisions taken at NATO.

Canada is the largest contributor to the NATO WPS office, providing \$400,000 over 2016-19 and an additional \$400,000 over 2019-20 and 2020-21 to fund activities and programmes in support of the mandate of the NATO Secretary General's Special Representative for WPS, Claire Hutchinson. Canada has been leading the NATO Human Resources policy development update to increase the hiring, promotion and retention of women as a priority. Canada has also had a significant role in the creation of a NATO chapter of the Chief of Defence (CHOD) WPS network, in which Canada will continue to take a leadership role. NATO and its partners are committed to showing the leadership required to promote the full implementation of UN Security Council Resolution (UNSCR) 1325 and the subsequent WPS resolutions. As part of this effort, DND/CAF submits an annual report to the NATO Committee on Gender Perspectives (NCGP). The Report is focused on Canada's implementation of UNSCR 1325 and related resolutions, i.e., increasing women's participation in the CAF, and the incorporation of gender into operations.

At the 2018 Brussels Summit, Leaders endorsed a renewed NATO WPS policy and action plan which recognizes that gender mainstreaming and increased representation of women in NATO civilian and military structures and in Allied and partner forces improves effectiveness and contribute to a more modern, agile, ready, and responsive Alliance. In support of this effort, Canada is leading a NATO research task group on the integration of women into ground combat units.

Canada has also launched the Elsie Initiative for Women in Peace Operations, a five-year pilot project that aims to catalyze transformational change in increasing women's meaningful participation in United Nations peace operations in uniformed military and police roles.

As part of SSE, Canada has made a commitment to integrate Gender Based Analysis+ (GBA+) in all defence activities across the DND/CAF, ranging from the design and implementation of programs and services to personnel support, equipment procurement, and operational planning. The use of GBA+ as an analytical tool enables the Government to identify the potential impacts of policies and programs on diverse groups of women, men and gender-diverse people. The "plus" acknowledges that GBA+ goes beyond sex and gender differences to consider multiple identity factors that intersect to make people who they are (such as race, ethnicity, religion, age,

gender identity and mental or physical disability). This will ensure that differentiated impacts on diverse groups of women, men and gender-diverse people are explicitly recognized and mitigated, as required. SSE also commits to increasing the proportion of women in the military by one percent annually, to move from the current 15 percent to 25 percent representation by 2026.

While Canada is an outspoken advocate and supporter for WPS initiatives, there are currently no plans for Canada to host an international integrated military and civilian conference on WPS as recommended.

#### **Recommendation 24**

**That the Government of Canada support the agenda of the NATO Secretary General's Special Representative for Women, Peace and Security (WPS) and the commitment of additional resources to that agenda including measures to promote increased recruitment of women in peacekeeping operations both domestically and in the militaries of our allies.**

The Government of Canada agrees with this recommendation. The Government has recently renewed Canada's National Action Plan on WPS and continues to be one of the strongest promoters of the WPS agenda in NATO. The benefits of women's participation in the prevention and resolution of conflict, in peacebuilding, peace operations and the security sector are well established, and gender equality has been linked to political stability and peace. The WPS agenda, based on UNSCR 1325 and subsequent WPS resolutions, recognises these links and sees women and girls not just as survivors of human rights violations or abuses, which are often exacerbated in conflict, but also as active agents for peace. Their participation in rebuilding war-torn societies is crucial to transform social and institutional structures and achieve more equal and stable societies for all.

The Office of the Secretary General's Special Representative for WPS, was established in 2012 to serve as the high-level focal point on NATO's work on the WPS agenda and to head the NATO WPS Office in Brussels. A Canadian, Claire Hutchinson, was appointed to the position in November 2017. Canada is the largest funder for the office, contributing \$400,000 in 2016-19 and an additional \$400,000 over 2019-20 and 2020-21. Canada's financial support to the office of the NATO Special Representative for WPS assists in implementing the NATO Action Plan to mainstream UNSCR 1325 on WPS and other related resolutions. Canadian funding supports a number of activities including: promoting gender equality and gender mainstreaming at NATO through workshops, exercises, training and mentoring; developing indicators and evaluation mechanisms to track NATO's mainstreaming of WPS; providing diplomacy and outreach; and engaging civil society, including through a Civil Society Advisory Panel on WPS. Canada has given financial support to the Civil Society Advisory Panel (CSAP) on WPS, including holding an annual meeting to promote better consultation and dialogue between civil society and NATO as well as North Atlantic Council consultations on the implementation of the WPS Action Plan.

During the UN Peacekeeping Defence Ministerial held in Vancouver in November 2017, Canada, in partnership with the United Kingdom and Bangladesh, launched the WPS CHOD Network. The purpose of this network is to provide a peer forum for WPS Champions to discuss

the barriers to effective implementation of WPS commitments, namely the integration of a gender perspective into military planning and operations, and improving the participation of women within their organizations, including in non-traditional military roles.

## **NATO's Unity and Interoperability**

### **Recommendation 25**

**That the Government of Canada directly engage with NATO members who may have compromised the security, military interoperability, and values of NATO, and help support them in upholding the shared NATO principles of protecting human rights, respecting the rule of law, promoting democracy, and protecting civilian populations.**

The Government of Canada agrees with this recommendation. Canada believes that we all benefit from democratic and stable NATO Allies that respect fundamental freedoms and human rights. Canada continues to urge its Allies to ensure that government policies, including measures taken to safeguard security, respect human rights and the rule of law. The Government of Canada will continue to raise these issues regularly in meetings with Allies and partners.

## **Canada and NATO Centres of Excellence**

### **Recommendation 26**

**That the Government of Canada indicate to the Steering Board of the European Centre of Excellence for Countering Hybrid Threats (Hybrid CoE) that Canada wishes to participate in the Hybrid CoE.**

The Government of Canada agrees with this recommendation. The Prime Minister announced Canada's intention to join the Hybrid CoE during the 2018 Brussels Summit. Canada's participation in the Hybrid CoE will enable it to not only access the wealth of research and exercises but also to shape the evolution of the program. In light of the continuing threat to Canadian and Allied security posed by hybrid warfare, membership with the Hybrid CoE is a prudent decision and Canada's participation and active involvement will enhance Canadian security.

### **Recommendation 27**

**That the Government of Canada establish a NATO Centre of Excellence in the area of security sector reform as this would allow Canada to offer the Alliance a standing capacity for military and police training to be used for conflict prevention and/or successful post-conflict reconstruction efforts.**

While the Government of Canada supports the advancement of security sector reform and agrees with the principle of this recommendation, it does not wish to replicate efforts of existing organizations and institutes. Several global institutes already focus on doctrine, concept development, lessons learned and training related to security sector reform, conflict prevention, and post-conflict reconstruction including the NATO Civil-Military Cooperation Centre of Excellence in the Netherlands. In addition, the Geneva Centre for Democratic Control of Armed Forces in Switzerland is a well-known global institute which also addresses these issues.